







Corrected Trees for Reliable Group Communication

Martin Küttler¹ Amnon Barak²

Maksym Planeta¹ Torsten Hoefler³ Jan Bierbaum¹ Ca

Carsten Weinhold¹ F

Hermann Härtig¹

¹TU Dresden ²The Hebrew University of Jerusalem ³ ETH Zürich

Principles and Practice of Parallel Programming, Washington D.C. 2019-02-19







-				hilling		il B B an	iiiiiiii	ante.	hana
Manan .	000000	ARARAS -	- Contene		100000	Junio 1	mmm	mmir	
annan.	annan a'	annan an a'		annun -		 Automatica a	figural.	Lunnur.	
internet.	000000								
	100000								11/11/1
									mann
	E. 1					•			. I







-	Tillitur	THE R	2000 Marca	hilling	HHH	il Hiller	in the	in the	
internet.	ALLONDA .	inni:	-	annan.		Junio A	Terrer .		
in the second second	termine.	ininini i			allanan -	Tunner I	Hunne.	Pinter -	
ininini minini	annant manna						interest interest		
	fammer.								
innin in									
•									
					•			-	







Inne	THINK	111111	hume		Hillin	in the second	HINE .	in the	inne
HIMME	PARTICI C		 Allenne.	in state of		Junio 1	ACCOUNTS:		
CTREASE.	ACCOUNTS.	ALLANDAR					HEITING.	THUR .	
inimite.					anning	Annual	ACCOUNT		
annin Ranna									
-									
distantia.									
1 × 1					•			· · ·	























200 PFLOPS 2 million cores







200 PFLOPS 2 million cores

1000 PFLOPS







1000 PFLOPS





"... quantitative change alters quality"





1000 PFLOPS







"... quantitative change alters quality"

Friedrich Engels



1000 PFLOPS







Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"





- Collective operation
- N processes

0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7







- Collective operation
- N processes
- Designated root





0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

- Collective operation
- *N* processes
- Designated root
- Point-to-point messages







- Collective operation
- *N* processes
- Designated root
- Point-to-point messages
- Messages color processes







- Collective operation
- *N* processes
- Designated root
- Point-to-point messages
- Messages color processes







- Collective operation
- N processes
- Designated root
- Point-to-point messages
- Messages color processes
- Linear broadcast







- Collective operation
- N processes
- Designated root
- Point-to-point messages
- Messages color processes
- Linear broadcast
- Bad scalability





Outline

- Scalable broadcast
- Fault tolerant broadcast





Outline

- Scalable broadcast
- Fault tolerant broadcast
- Our contribution: Corrected Trees
 - 1. Construction for several variants
 - 2. Theoretical analysis
 - 3. Study with network simulation
 - 4. Proof-of-concept implementation





- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root







- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree





 \bigcirc

- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree







- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat







- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat







- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat







- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat
 - Assign processes in Depth First order







- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat
 - Assign processes in Depth First order







- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat
 - Assign processes in Depth First order







- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat
 - Assign processes in Depth First order







- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat
 - Assign processes in Depth First order







- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat
 - Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
 - Root has the message







- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat
 - Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
 - Root has the message







- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat
 - Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
 - Root has the message







- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat
 - Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
 - Root has the message
 - Send in parallel






- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat
 - Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
 - Root has the message
 - Send in parallel







- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat
 - Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
 - Root has the message
 - Send in parallel
 - Double every time









- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat
 - Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
 - Root has the message
 - Send in parallel
 - Double every time







- Binomial tree
 - Start from the root
 - Copy the tree
 - Repeat
 - Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
 - Root has the message
 - Send in parallel
 - Double every time
 - $O(\log(n))$ depth















• Non-leaf failure







- Non-leaf failure
- Message is silently lost







- Non-leaf failure
- Message is silently lost







- Non-leaf failure
- Message is silently lost
- Partial coloring







- Non-leaf failure
- Message is silently lost
- Partial coloring
- Healthy processes remain uncolored





Failures

- Every live process receives a message (like linear broadcast)
- Low latency (like tree broadcast)
- Fail-stop model
- Reliable messages
- The root is alive
- Multiple failures: details in the paper





Failures

- Every live process receives a message (like linear broadcast)
- Low latency (like tree broadcast)
- Fail-stop model
- Reliable messages
- The root is alive
- Multiple failures: details in the paper
- Future MPI standards will handle failures (example: ULFM)







• Broadcast along the tree

¹Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."









• Broadcast along the tree

¹Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."









- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs

¹Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."









- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs

¹Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."









- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs

¹Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."









- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs
- Ready when no ACK pending

¹Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."









- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs
- Ready when no ACK pending
- Children send ACKs

¹Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."







- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs
- Ready when no ACK pending
- Children send ACKs

¹Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."









- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs
- Ready when no ACK pending
- Children send ACKs

¹Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."









- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs
- Ready when no ACK pending
- Children send ACKs
- The root waits for all ACKs

¹Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."







• Run as usual









• Run as usual









• Run as usual











- Run as usual
- Message is lost









- Run as usual
- Message is lost









- Run as usual
- Message is lost
- Failure detection









- Run as usual
- Message is lost
- Failure detection
- Notify the root







- Run as usual
- Message is lost
- Failure detection
- Notify the root
- Restructure the tree







- Run as usual
- Message is lost
- Failure detection
- Notify the root
- Restructure the tree
- Double the latency







- Run as usual
- Message is lost
- Failure detection
- Notify the root
- Restructure the tree
- Double the latency
- Unnecessary waiting





Simulated Latency: Acknowledged Broadcast







Simulated Latency: Acknowledged Broadcast







Simulated Latency: Acknowledged Broadcast







Gossip-based Broadcast²



• No tree structure

²Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."






- No tree structure
- Send to random process (Gossip)

²Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."







- No tree structure
- Send to random process (Gossip)

²Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."







²Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."



No tree structure

Multiple rounds

(Gossip)

•

Send to random process





- No tree structure
- Send to random process (Gossip)
- Multiple rounds

²Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."







²Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."



No tree structure

Multiple rounds

(Gossip)

•

Send to random process





²Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."



No tree structure

• Multiple rounds

(Gossip)

Send to random process





- No tree structure
- Send to random process (Gossip)
- Multiple rounds

²Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."







- No tree structure
- Send to random process (Gossip)
- Multiple rounds
- Full reachability with high probability

²Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."







²Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."



- Send to random process (Gossip)
- Multiple rounds
- Full reachability with high probability
- Inherently fault tolerant
- No need for failure detector









• Keep processes in a ring

³Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."









- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase

³Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."









- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase

³Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."









- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase

³Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."









- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase

³Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."









- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase
- Correction phase
 - Send along the ring

³Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."









- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase
- Correction phase
 - Send along the ring

³Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."









- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase
- Correction phase
 - Send along the ring
- Better coloring guarantee

³Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."



Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"





- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase
- Correction phase
 - Send along the ring
- Better coloring guarantee
- Inherently fault tolerant

³Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."









- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase
- Correction phase
 - Send along the ring
- Better coloring guarantee
- Inherently fault tolerant
- Different correction types

³Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."







Simulated Latency: Corrected Gossip







Simulated Latency: Corrected Gossip























Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"





































Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"







Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"



• Non-leaf failure





Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"





• Non-leaf failure



Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"









Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"




















Correcting a Broadcast Tree with a Failure



















Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"





1. Tree phase

- Interleave parents and children





Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"





1. Tree phase

- Interleave parents and children





Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"









Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"





































- 1. Tree phase
 - Interleave parents and children
 - Recursively repeat



















- 1. Tree phase
 - Interleave parents and children
 - Recursively repeat
- 2. Correction phase















• Non-leaf failure



























Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"

18/22



8

Simulated Latency: Corrected Trees







Simulated Latency: Corrected Trees







Evaluation

- OpenMPI-based
- 512×72 -core nodes = 36 864 processes
- Piz Daint (Cray XC 40)





Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"



































Conclusion

- Corrected Trees
 - Interleaved Trees
 - Correction Phase





Conclusion

- Corrected Trees
 - Interleaved Trees
 - Correction Phase
- Properties
 - Reliable broadcast
 - Faster than acknowledged tree
 - Less messages than Corrected Gossip





Conclusion

- Corrected Trees
 - Interleaved Trees
 - Correction Phase
- Properties
 - Reliable broadcast
 - Faster than acknowledged tree
 - Less messages than Corrected Gossip
- Closed-form expression for binomial
- Simple construction for other practical tree types
- Future work: Other collectives





Backup Slides





- 1. Opportunistic correction
 - Fixed rounds
 - Probabilistic reachability

⁴Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."



Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"





- 1. Opportunistic correction
 - Fixed rounds
 - Probabilistic reachability
- 2. Checked correction
 - Variable rounds
 - Guaranteed reachability

⁴Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."







- 1. Opportunistic correction
 - Fixed rounds
 - Probabilistic reachability
- 2. Checked correction
 - Variable rounds
 - Guaranteed reachability
- 3. Failure-proof correction
 - Extended checked correction
 - Tolerates online failures

⁴Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."







- 1. Opportunistic correction
 - Fixed rounds
 - Probabilistic reachability
- 2. Checked correction
 - Variable rounds
 - Guaranteed reachability
- 3. Failure-proof correction
 - Extended checked correction
 - Tolerates online failures

⁴Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."






Correction Types⁴

- 1. Opportunistic correction
 - Fixed rounds
 - Probabilistic reachability
- 2. Checked correction
 - Variable rounds
 - Guaranteed reachability
- 3. Failure-proof correction
 - Extended checked correction
 - Tolerates online failures

Limitations:

- Only broadcast for now
- Small messages

⁴Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."





Different Corrected Trees



Figure: Broadcast median latency (system X)



Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"







LogP-like model
Send overhead







- LogP-like model
 - Send overhead
 - p2p-Latency







- LogP-like model
 - Send overhead
 - p2p-Latency
 - Receive overhead







- LogP-like model
 - Send overhead
 - p2p-Latency
 - Receive overhead
 - Parallel send and receive







- LogP-like model
 - Send overhead
 - p2p-Latency
 - Receive overhead
 - Parallel send and receive







- LogP-like model
 - Send overhead
 - p2p-Latency
 - Receive overhead
 - Parallel send and receive







- LogP-like model
 - Send overhead
 - p2p-Latency
 - Receive overhead
 - Parallel send and receive
- Fault model
 - Failed processes







- LogP-like model
 - Send overhead
 - p2p-Latency
 - Receive overhead
 - Parallel send and receive
- Fault model
 - Failed processes







- LogP-like model
 - Send overhead
 - p2p-Latency
 - Receive overhead
 - Parallel send and receive
- Fault model
 - Failed processes
 - Failures not detected







Simulation: Message Count













































































Simulation: Latency Sturdiness



Figure: Average quiescence latency grows with fault rate





Simulation: Message Count Sturdiness



Figure: Average number of messages goes down with higher fault rate



Maksym Planeta: "Corrected Trees"





Component Failures in HPC Systems⁵

Component	# of Nodes Affected	MTBF
PFS, core switch	1,408	65.10 days
Rack	32	86.90 days
Edge switch	16	17.37 days
PSU	4	28.94 days
Compute node	1	15.8 hours

Data gathered between 2010-11-01 and 2012-04-06 on TSUBAME 2.0

⁵Sato et al., "Design and Modeling of a Non-blocking Checkpointing System."



