# Corrected Trees for Reliable Group Communication 

$\begin{array}{llll}\text { Martin Küttler } & \text { Maksym Planeta }^{1} & \text { Jan Bierbaum }\end{array}{ }^{1} \quad$ Carsten Weinhold ${ }^{1}$ Hermann Härtig ${ }^{1}$<br>${ }^{1}$ TU Dresden $\quad{ }^{2}$ The Hebrew University of Jerusalem ${ }^{3}$ ETH Zürich

Principles and Practice of Parallel Programming, Washington D.C.
2019-02-19

## Motivation



## Motivation



$$
\begin{array}{lllll}
P_{1} & P_{2} & P_{3} & P_{n}
\end{array}
$$

$$
\Downarrow \sqrt[v]{ }, \cdots \quad \sqrt{k}
$$

## Motivation


$\begin{array}{llll}P_{1} & P_{2} & P_{3} & P_{n}\end{array}$


Communication

## Motivation



## Motivation



## Motivation



## Race to Exascale



## 200 PFLOPS

2 million cores

## Race to Exascale



200 PFLOPS
2 million cores

## 1000 PFLOPS

## Race to Exascale



## 1000 PFLOPS

## Race to Exascale

". . quantitative change alters quality" Friedrich Engels



## Race to Exascale

"... quantitative change alters quality" Friedrich Engels



## Broadcast

- Collective operation
- $N$ processes
(0) (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7)


## Broadcast

- Collective operation
- $N$ processes
- Designated root

(4) (5) (6) (7)


## Broadcast

(2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7)

- Collective operation
- $N$ processes
- Designated root
- Point-to-point messages


## Broadcast


(3) (4) (5) (6) (7)

- Collective operation
- $N$ processes
- Designated root
- Point-to-point messages
- Messages color processes


## Broadcast


(4) (5) (6) (7)

- Collective operation
- $N$ processes
- Designated root
- Point-to-point messages
- Messages color processes


## Broadcast



- Collective operation
- $N$ processes
- Designated root
- Point-to-point messages
- Messages color processes
- Linear broadcast


## Broadcast

## Outline

- Scalable broadcast
- Fault tolerant broadcast


## Outline

- Scalable broadcast
- Fault tolerant broadcast
- Our contribution: Corrected Trees

1. Construction for several variants
2. Theoretical analysis
3. Study with network simulation
4. Proof-of-concept implementation

## Tree-based Broadcast

- Binomial tree
- Start from the root


## Tree-based Broadcast

- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree


## Tree-based Broadcast

- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree


## Tree-based Broadcast

- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat


## Tree-based Broadcast

- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat


## Tree-based Broadcast

- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat


## Tree-based Broadcast



- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat
- Assign processes in Depth First order


## Tree-based Broadcast



- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat
- Assign processes in Depth First order


## Tree-based Broadcast



- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat
- Assign processes in Depth First order


## Tree-based Broadcast



- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat
- Assign processes in Depth First order


## Tree-based Broadcast

- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat
- Assign processes in Depth First order


## Tree-based Broadcast

- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat
- Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
- Root has the message


## Tree-based Broadcast

- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat
- Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
- Root has the message


## Tree-based Broadcast

- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat
- Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
- Root has the message


## Tree-based Broadcast

- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat
- Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
- Root has the message
- Send in parallel


## Tree-based Broadcast

- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat
- Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
- Root has the message
- Send in parallel


## Tree-based Broadcast

- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat
- Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
- Root has the message
- Send in parallel
- Double every time


## Tree-based Broadcast

- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat
- Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
- Root has the message
- Send in parallel
- Double every time


## Tree-based Broadcast

- Binomial tree
- Start from the root
- Copy the tree
- Repeat
- Assign processes in Depth First order
- Broadcast
- Root has the message
- Send in parallel
- Double every time
- O( $\log (n)$ ) depth


## Broadcast with a Failed Process



## Broadcast with a Failed Process



- Non-leaf failure


## Broadcast with a Failed Process



- Non-leaf failure
- Message is silently lost


## Broadcast with a Failed Process

- Non-leaf failure
- Message is silently lost



## Broadcast with a Failed Process



- Non-leaf failure
- Message is silently lost
- Partial coloring


## Broadcast with a Failed Process



- Non-leaf failure
- Message is silently lost
- Partial coloring
- Healthy processes remain uncolored


## Failures

- Every live process receives a message (like linear broadcast)
- Low latency (like tree broadcast)
- Fail-stop model
- Reliable messages
- The root is alive
- Multiple failures: details in the paper


## Failures

- Every live process receives a message (like linear broadcast)
- Low latency (like tree broadcast)
- Fail-stop model
- Reliable messages
- The root is alive
- Multiple failures: details in the paper
- Future MPI standards will handle failures (example: ULFM)


## Acknowledged Broadcast ${ }^{1}$



- Broadcast along the tree

[^0]
## Acknowledged Broadcast ${ }^{1}$



- Broadcast along the tree

[^1]
## Acknowledged Broadcast ${ }^{1}$



- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs

[^2]
## Acknowledged Broadcast ${ }^{1}$



- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs

[^3]
## Acknowledged Broadcast ${ }^{1}$



- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs

[^4]
## Acknowledged Broadcast ${ }^{1}$



- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs
- Ready when no ACK pending

[^5]
## Acknowledged Broadcast ${ }^{1}$



- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs
- Ready when no ACK pending
- Children send ACKs

[^6]
## Acknowledged Broadcast ${ }^{1}$



- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs
- Ready when no ACK pending
- Children send ACKs

[^7]
## Acknowledged Broadcast ${ }^{1}$



- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs
- Ready when no ACK pending
- Children send ACKs

[^8]
## Acknowledged Broadcast ${ }^{1}$



- Broadcast along the tree
- Waiting for ACKs
- Ready when no ACK pending
- Children send ACKs
- The root waits for all ACKs

[^9]
## Acknowledged Broadcast with Failures

- Run as usual



## Acknowledged Broadcast with Failures

- Run as usual



## Acknowledged Broadcast with Failures

- Run as usual



## Acknowledged Broadcast with Failures

- Run as usual
- Message is lost



## Acknowledged Broadcast with Failures

- Run as usual
- Message is lost


## Acknowledged Broadcast with Failures



- Run as usual
- Message is lost
- Failure detection


## Acknowledged Broadcast with Failures

- Run as usual
- Message is lost
- Failure detection
- Notify the root


## Acknowledged Broadcast with Failures

- Run as usual
- Message is lost
- Failure detection
- Notify the root
- Restructure the tree


## Acknowledged Broadcast with Failures

- Run as usual
- Message is lost
- Failure detection
- Notify the root
- Restructure the tree
- Double the latency


## Acknowledged Broadcast with Failures

- Run as usual
- Message is lost
- Failure detection
- Notify the root
- Restructure the tree
- Double the latency
- Unnecessary waiting


## Simulated Latency: Acknowledged Broadcast




## Simulated Latency: Acknowledged Broadcast




## Simulated Latency: Acknowledged Broadcast



## Gossip-based Broadcast²



## Gossip-based Broadcast²



- No tree structure
- Send to random process (Gossip)


## Gossip-based Broadcast²



- No tree structure
- Send to random process (Gossip)

[^10]
## Gossip-based Broadcast²



- No tree structure
- Send to random process (Gossip)
- Multiple rounds

[^11]
## Gossip-based Broadcast²



- No tree structure
- Send to random process (Gossip)
- Multiple rounds

[^12]
## Gossip-based Broadcast²



- No tree structure
- Send to random process (Gossip)
- Multiple rounds

[^13]
## Gossip-based Broadcast²



- No tree structure
- Send to random process (Gossip)
- Multiple rounds

[^14]
## Gossip-based Broadcast²



- No tree structure
- Send to random process (Gossip)
- Multiple rounds

[^15]
## Gossip-based Broadcast²



- No tree structure
- Send to random process (Gossip)
- Multiple rounds
- Full reachability with high probability


## Gossip-based Broadcast²



- No tree structure
- Send to random process (Gossip)
- Multiple rounds
- Full reachability with high probability
- Inherently fault tolerant
- No need for failure detector

[^16]
## Corrected Gossip-based Broadcast ${ }^{3}$



[^17]
## Corrected Gossip-based Broadcast ${ }^{3}$



- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase

[^18]
## Corrected Gossip-based Broadcast ${ }^{3}$



- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase

[^19]
## Corrected Gossip-based Broadcast ${ }^{3}$



- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase

[^20]
## Corrected Gossip-based Broadcast ${ }^{3}$



- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase

[^21]
## Corrected Gossip-based Broadcast ${ }^{3}$



- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase
- Correction phase
- Send along the ring

[^22]
## Corrected Gossip-based Broadcast ${ }^{3}$



- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase
- Correction phase
- Send along the ring

[^23]
## Corrected Gossip-based Broadcast ${ }^{3}$



- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase
- Correction phase
- Send along the ring
- Better coloring guarantee

[^24]
## Corrected Gossip-based Broadcast ${ }^{3}$



- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase
- Correction phase
- Send along the ring
- Better coloring guarantee
- Inherently fault tolerant

[^25]
## Corrected Gossip-based Broadcast ${ }^{3}$



- Keep processes in a ring
- Gossip phase
- Correction phase
- Send along the ring
- Better coloring guarantee
- Inherently fault tolerant
- Different correction types

[^26]
## Simulated Latency: Corrected Gossip




## Simulated Latency: Corrected Gossip




## Correcting a Broadcast Tree



## Correcting a Broadcast Tree

- Tree phase



## Correcting a Broadcast Tree



## Correcting a Broadcast Tree

- Tree phase
- Binomial tree



## Correcting a Broadcast Tree

- Tree phase
- Binomial tree



## Correcting a Broadcast Tree

- Tree phase
- Binomial tree
- Correction phase



## Correcting a Broadcast Tree

- Tree phase
- Binomial tree
- Correction phase



## Correcting a Broadcast Tree

- Tree phase
- Binomial tree
- Correction phase
- Guaranteed coloring



## Correcting a Broadcast Tree with a Failure



## Correcting a Broadcast Tree with a Failure

- Non-leaf failure



## Correcting a Broadcast Tree with a Failure

- Non-leaf failure



## Correcting a Broadcast Tree with a Failure

- Non-leaf failure



## Correcting a Broadcast Tree with a Failure

- Non-leaf failure

- Partial coloring



## Correcting a Broadcast Tree with a Failure

- Non-leaf failure
- Partial coloring
- Correction is inefficient



## Correcting a Broadcast Tree with a Failure

- Non-leaf failure

- Partial coloring
- Correction is inefficient



## Correcting a Broadcast Tree with a Failure

- Non-leaf failure

- Partial coloring
- Correction is inefficient
- Live processes stay uncolored



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast

| $\text { (6) } 5 \text { (4) (3) }$ |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| (7) | (1) |
| (8) | (0) |
| (9) | (15) |
| (10) (11) (13) |  |

1. Tree phase


## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast



1. Tree phase

- Interleave parents and children



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast



1. Tree phase

- Interleave parents and children



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast



1. Tree phase

- Interleave parents and children



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast



1. Tree phase

- Interleave parents and children
- Recursively repeat



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast



## 1. Tree phase

- Interleave parents and children
- Recursively repeat



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast



## 1. Tree phase

- Interleave parents and children
- Recursively repeat



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast



## 1. Tree phase

- Interleave parents and children
- Recursively repeat



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast



1. Tree phase

- Interleave parents and children
- Recursively repeat



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast



## 1. Tree phase

- Interleave parents and children
- Recursively repeat



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast



1. Tree phase

- Interleave parents and children
- Recursively repeat



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast



1. Tree phase

- Interleave parents and children
- Recursively repeat

2. Correction phase


## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast with Failure



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast with Failure

- Non-leaf failure



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast with Failure

- Non-leaf failure

- Continue coloring



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast with Failure

- Non-leaf failure

- Continue coloring



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast with Failure

- Non-leaf failure

- Continue coloring
- Small holes



## Corrected Tree-based Broadcast with Failure

- Non-leaf failure

- Continue coloring
- Small holes
- Correction phase



## Simulated Latency: Corrected Trees




## Simulated Latency: Corrected Trees




## Evaluation

- OpenMPI-based
- $512 \times 72$-core nodes $=36864$ processes
- Piz Daint (Cray XC 40)



## MPI-based Implementation



## MPI-based Implementation



## MPI-based Implementation



## MPI-based Implementation



## MPI-based Implementation



## Conclusion

- Corrected Trees
- Interleaved Trees
- Correction Phase


## Conclusion

- Corrected Trees
- Interleaved Trees
- Correction Phase
- Properties
- Reliable broadcast
- Faster than acknowledged tree
- Less messages than Corrected Gossip


## Conclusion

- Corrected Trees
- Interleaved Trees
- Correction Phase
- Properties
- Reliable broadcast
- Faster than acknowledged tree
- Less messages than Corrected Gossip
- Closed-form expression for binomial
- Simple construction for other practical tree types
- Future work: Other collectives


## Backup Slides

## Correction Types ${ }^{4}$

1. Opportunistic correction

- Fixed rounds
- Probabilistic reachability

[^27]
## Correction Types ${ }^{4}$

1. Opportunistic correction

- Fixed rounds
- Probabilistic reachability

2. Checked correction

- Variable rounds
- Guaranteed reachability

[^28]
## Correction Types ${ }^{4}$

1. Opportunistic correction

- Fixed rounds
- Probabilistic reachability

2. Checked correction

- Variable rounds
- Guaranteed reachability

3. Failure-proof correction

- Extended checked correction
- Tolerates online failures

[^29]
## Correction Types ${ }^{4}$

1. Opportunistic correction

- Fixed rounds
- Probabilistic reachability

2. Checked correction

- Variable rounds
- Guaranteed reachability

3. Failure-proof correction

- Extended checked correction
- Tolerates online failures

[^30]
## Correction Types ${ }^{4}$

1. Opportunistic correction

- Fixed rounds
- Probabilistic reachability

2. Checked correction

- Variable rounds
- Guaranteed reachability

Limitations:

- Only broadcast for now
- Small messages

3. Failure-proof correction

- Extended checked correction
- Tolerates online failures

[^31]
## Different Corrected Trees



Figure: Broadcast median latency (system X)

## Latency Model



- LogP-like model
- Send overhead


## Latency Model



- LogP-like model
- Send overhead
- p2p-Latency


## Latency Model



## Latency Model



## Latency Model



- LogP-like model
- Send overhead
- p2p-Latency
- Receive overhead
- Parallel send and receive


## Latency Model



- LogP-like model
- Send overhead
- p2p-Latency
- Receive overhead
- Parallel send and receive


## Latency Model



## Latency Model



## Latency Model



## Simulation: Message Count




Correction Type (distance $d$ )

## Broadcast Timeline




## Broadcast Timeline




## Broadcast Timeline



## Broadcast Timeline



## Broadcast Timeline




## Broadcast Timeline




## Broadcast Timeline




## Broadcast Timeline




## Broadcast Timeline




## Broadcast Timeline




## Simulation: Latency Sturdiness



Figure: Average quiescence latency grows with fault rate

## Simulation: Message Count Sturdiness



Figure: Average number of messages goes down with higher fault rate

## Component Failures in HPC Systems ${ }^{5}$

| Component | \# of Nodes Affected | MTBF |
| :--- | ---: | ---: |
| PFS, core switch | 1,408 | 65.10 days |
| Rack | 32 | 86.90 days |
| Edge switch | 16 | 17.37 days |
| PSU | 4 | 28.94 days |
| Compute node | 1 | 15.8 hours |

Data gathered between 2010-11-01 and 2012-04-06 on Tsubame 2.0

[^32]
[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."

[^1]:    ${ }^{1}$ Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."

[^2]:    ${ }^{1}$ Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."

[^3]:    ${ }^{1}$ Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."

[^4]:    ${ }^{1}$ Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."

[^5]:    ${ }^{1}$ Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."

[^6]:    ${ }^{1}$ Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."

[^7]:    ${ }^{1}$ Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."

[^8]:    ${ }^{1}$ Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."

[^9]:    ${ }^{1}$ Buntinas, "Scalable Distributed Consensus to Support MPI Fault Tolerance."

[^10]:    ${ }^{2}$ Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."

[^11]:    ${ }^{2}$ Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."

[^12]:    ${ }^{2}$ Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."

[^13]:    ${ }^{2}$ Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."

[^14]:    ${ }^{2}$ Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."

[^15]:    ${ }^{2}$ Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."

[^16]:    ${ }^{2}$ Birman et al., "Bimodal Multicast."

[^17]:    ${ }^{3}$ Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."

[^18]:    ${ }^{3}$ Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."

[^19]:    ${ }^{3}$ Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."

[^20]:    ${ }^{3}$ Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."

[^21]:    ${ }^{3}$ Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."

[^22]:    ${ }^{3}$ Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."

[^23]:    ${ }^{3}$ Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."

[^24]:    ${ }^{3}$ Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."

[^25]:    ${ }^{3}$ Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."

[^26]:    ${ }^{3}$ Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."

[^27]:    ${ }^{4}$ Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."

[^28]:    ${ }^{4}$ Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."

[^29]:    ${ }^{4}$ Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."

[^30]:    ${ }^{4}$ Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."

[^31]:    ${ }^{4}$ Hoefler et al., "Corrected Gossip Algorithms for Fast Reliable Broadcast on Unreliable Systems."

[^32]:    ${ }^{5}$ Sato et al., "Design and Modeling of a Non-blocking Checkpointing System."

